Summary Minutes
National Clinical Effectiveness Committee (NCEC)
8th September, 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Present</th>
<th>Apologies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prof. Hilary Humphreys (Chair)</td>
<td>Dr. Áine Carroll</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Elaine Breslin</td>
<td>Dr Anne Marie Brady</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Fiona Cahill</td>
<td>Dr Philip Crowley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Linda Dillon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Fionnuala Duffy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Graham Love</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Donal Clancy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Susan O’Reilly</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Philippa Ryan Withero</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Dubhfeasla Slattery</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Rosemary Smyth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Bridget Doherty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Jayne Crowe</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Dermot Malone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Máirín Ryan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Secretariat: Ms. Susan Reilly, Ms. Paula Monks

Clinical Effectiveness Unit: Dr. Kathleen Mac Lellan, Dr Sarah Condell, Ms Niamh O’Rourke, Ms Rosarie Lynch.

Lunch and Learn Session
The meeting opened with a ‘lunch and learn’ session given by HSE Librarian, Mr. Gethin White on ‘The Role of PICOs in defining key questions for systematic evidence reviews for guidelines’. The Chair thanked Mr. White for his very detailed and informative presentation. The presentation/slides will be placed on the NCEC website.

Item 1 Apologies
Dr. Áine Carroll, Dr Anne Marie Brady, Dr Philip Crowley

Item 2 Correspondence
Two items of correspondence:
- Dr Michael Shannon to Minister for Health advising his resignation from NCEC (15th June 2015)
- Dr Vida Hamilton – Email received 31/08/2015 regarding potential for Medical Council support for NCEC National Clinical Guidelines. This will be followed up.

Item 3 Minutes
The minutes of the previous meeting 27th May, 2015 were agreed.
- Action 1: Weighting of prioritisation criteria – will reflect on at a future date. No final decision will be made at this time.
- All other action points are on the agenda for further discussion.
Item 4 Matters Arising
HRB – Discussions are on-going between the Department and the HRB regarding a process through which the NCEC could obtain support for systematic literature reviews from the HRB.

Item 5 Membership Orientation Meeting
Two orientation meetings were held during summer for Committee members (16th July and 18th August). These were attended by 14 NCEC members.

Items discussed:
- NCEC history
- National Clinical Guidelines
- National Clinical Audit
- Standards for Clinical Practice Guidance
- Modus Operandi

Items raised:
- NCEC communications and media profile/potential for campaigns
- NCEC engagement with undergraduate and postgraduate curricula
- Guideline ‘Notice of Intent’ processes to include request for update
- CPD credits for participation in NCEC activities
- Protected time for participation in guideline development
- International review and public consultation for guidelines
- 2015/2016 meeting dates and events
- Addition to NCEC meeting regarding actions required for agenda items
- Use of information technology
- Training or placement opportunities with NCEC
- Diagram to identify NCEC national context (potential infographic)

The Chair thanked everyone for attending. It was agreed that the issues discussed would be worked through and put on the agenda of further NCEC meetings as applicable.

Item 6 National Clinical Guidelines

(a) Conflict of Interest
The CoI form related to Clinical Guidelines CG-025, CG-032, CG-041 was circulated.

(b) List of National Clinical Guidelines
A list of published National Clinical Guidelines was circulated to all members. An update was given on the list of active National Clinical Guidelines undergoing NCEC processes. The NCEC has received five ‘Notices of Intent’ from the National Cancer Control Programme. The NCEC is also engaged in very early discussions with the Clinical Programmes regarding other potential Guidelines.

(c) Guideline Prioritisation Reports

CG041 ED Early Warning System
(Report circulated at the meeting and proposal document available)

Ms Rosarie Lynch presented the prioritisation report on the above guideline proposal.
**Decision:**
Prioritisation of CG041 ED Early Warning System agreed. CG041 ED Early Warning System will be placed on the NCEC Register of Guidelines.

**(d) Guideline Appraisal Reports**

**CG-032 Gestational Trophoblastic Disease**
*Report circulated at the meeting and guideline document available*

Ms Rosarie Lynch presented the appraisal report on the above guideline.

**Decision**
Clinical guideline CG-032 Gestational Trophoblastic Disease is recommended to the CMO for endorsement as a National Clinical Guideline following minor amendments approved by the Clinical Effectiveness Unit, Department of Health.

**CG-025 Paediatric Early Warning System (PEWS)**
*Report circulated at the meeting and guideline document available*

Ms Niamh O’Rourke presented the appraisal report on the above guideline. The guideline on Paediatric Early Warning Systems (PEWS) was developed in response to the HIQA Patient Safety Investigation Report into Services at University Hospital Galway (2013).

**Decision**
Clinical guideline CG-025 Paediatric Early Warning System (PEWS) is recommended to the CMO for endorsement as a National Clinical Guideline following minor amendments to be approved by the Clinical Effectiveness Unit, Department of Health. The GRADE methodology utilised should be approved by the GRADE expert once recommendations for additional information are added by the GDG.

**(e) Update – Induction of Labour/Oxytocin Guideline**

Actions to progress the guideline were agreed with Professor Turner as follows:

- **Scope:** Guideline for the induction and acceleration of labour (use of oxytocin) developed to the level required of an NCEC National Clinical Guideline.
- **Sponsor:** HSE Clinical Strategy and Programmes. The HSE Obstetrics and Gynaecology Clinical Programme will establish a Guideline Development Group. Professor Michael Turner will chair this group in collaboration with an identified midwifery lead.
- **Commissioning of evidence review and budget impact analysis:** The Clinical Effectiveness Unit (CEU) Department of Health/NCEC will commission through a tendering process a systematic evidence literature review, systematic economic literature review and budget impact analysis in line with NCEC templates. CEU will support the chairing of this commissioned work with the Chair of the Guideline Development Group.
- **Timeframe:** Establish Guideline Development Group by Q4 2015 and commence guideline development with a view to submission to NCEC Q4 2016.
Item 7 National Clinical Audit
Documents circulated prior to the meeting: Draft *National Clinical Audit Consultation Report* and draft *National Clinical Audit Prioritisation and Quality Assurance Criteria*.

Dr. Condell gave a brief summary of the draft *National Clinical Audit Consultation Report* highlighting main issues raised and how these were subsequently addressed in the Draft *National Clinical Audit Prioritisation and Quality Assurance Criteria* document. Thirteen responses were received in the public consultation and five main themes emerged. All submitter’s suggestions are responded to in the consultation report and the draft *Clinical Audit Prioritisation and Quality Assurance Criteria* amended as necessary to incorporate observations. In addition to commenting on the document some submitters used the opportunity to highlight other issues. While this feedback went beyond the scope of the consultation, it will, where appropriate, be considered in other NCEC deliberations.

Commentary:
- Some committee members commented that there appears to be some confusion in the system around the clinical audit landscape. CEU will work with other key stakeholders to clarify these issues.
- On behalf of the hospital group managers, Dr Susan O’Reilly sought clarification on the NCEC role in relation to National Clinical Audit and was assured that it remained that of prioritisation, quality assurance and potentially some commissioning of National Clinical Audit as per NCEC. The Hospital Groups’ main concern is who is going to audit and what will be audited. It was clarified that local audit will continue. NCEC audit commissioning will be through a tendering process with audits coming through the NCEC for assurance purposes.
- NOCA welcomed the opportunity to have its audits quality assured and endorsed by the NCEC Audit process.
- It was noted that the audit process as described refers to *National Standards for Safer Better Health Care*. The *Mental Health Services Quality Framework* also needs to be included as a set of standards from the Mental Health Commission. This will be reflected in the document.
- A suggestion that Figure 2 in the document be fully worked to demonstrate the Ratings and Calculation of Categorical Score.

Dr Condell reported that *Audit Templates* for application to NCEC review in addition to a *Framework for Endorsement of National Clinical Audit* were in the process of being drafted, with the latter due to NCEC October 2015 meeting for decision. Following this decision the NCEC may then request a National Clinical Audit to volunteer to undergo NCEC audit prioritisation and quality assurance processes.

Decision
- Publish the *National Clinical Audit Consultation* on the NCEC website.
- Publish the *National Clinical Audit Prioritisation and Quality Assurance Criteria* on the NCEC website for information purposes taking into consideration the above suggestions.
Item 8 Standards for Clinical Practice Guidance
Documents circulated prior to the meeting: Draft Standards for Clinical Practice Guidance Consultation Report and draft Standards for Clinical Practice Guidance.

The draft Standards for Clinical Practice Guidance including the report from the public consultation were presented. The draft Standards for Clinical Practice Guidance were developed by the NCEC, informed by a systematic literature review, advice from the Expert Advisory Group and feedback from a public consultation process.

The objectives of the Standards are to:
- Publish standards which will provide a standardised nomenclature and methodology for the development of evidence-based clinical practice guidance nationally.
- Ensure consistency of approach and minimize duplication in clinical practice guidance.

The draft Standards for Clinical Practice Guidance were presented to the committee and were approved pending minor amendments as follows:
- Unified language for HSE and non-HSE services
- Unified language throughout the document to describe governance structures.

The report from the public consultation was approved with minor amendments such as inclusion of additional acronyms.

Decision
- Publish the Standards for Clinical Practice Guidance Consultation Report on the NCEC website.
- Publish the Standards for Clinical Practice Guidance on the NCEC website following formal launch.

Item 9 – Modus Operandi
The draft Modus Operandi was circulated and discussed. Committee members were invited to provide comment on the draft document in advance of the next meeting. The document will be re-circulated in advance of the next meeting with consideration given processes for establishment of committee subgroups. Dr Withero agreed to examine decision frameworks for NCEC for inclusion in the Modus Operandi.

Item 10 NCEC Events

NCEC Symposium (Dublin Castle) 25th November, 2015
Details of the programme for the Symposium were outlined to the Committee. The programme will be finalised and circulated shortly.

NCEC Training
KML outlined progress on the organisation of training days for guideline developers. Suggestions from Committee would be welcomed on how to build the education programme for guideline developers and auditors.

Item 11 Next NCEC Meeting Dates 2015
- Tuesday October 13th 2015 - 1.00 pm to 4.30 pm
- Tuesday January 26th 2016 - 1.00 pm to 4.30 pm
• Tuesday March 15th 2016 - 1.00 pm to 4.30 pm

**Item 12 – AOB**

It was queried whether the NCEC could arrange for attendance certs to be given to use for gaining CPD points. It was agreed that these could be issued.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Person Responsible</th>
<th>Timeframe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Potential for Medical Council support for NCEC National Clinical Guidelines</td>
<td>Dr K Mac Lellan</td>
<td>ASAP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Draft audit templates for application and Framework for Endorsement of National Clinical Audit.</td>
<td>Dr. S Condell</td>
<td>ASAP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 NCEC Members to provide feedback on Modus Operandi</td>
<td>NCEC members</td>
<td>ASAP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Modus Operandi – decision making framework</td>
<td>Dr P Ryan Withero</td>
<td>ASAP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Finalise and circulate NCEC Symposium Programme</td>
<td>Dr K Mac Lellan</td>
<td>ASAP</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Professor Hilary Humphreys
Chairman