

National Paediatric Hospital

Independent Review

The independent review of the project to build the National Paediatric Hospital on the site of the Mater Misericordiae hospital was commissioned by Dr James Reilly TD, Minister for Health. The review's terms of reference, dated 12th May 2011, are as follows:

1. *To examine and independently verify the estimated cost differentials identified in relation to building, equipping and running the proposed National Paediatric Hospital (a) if constructed on the site currently proposed and (b) if constructed to the same specification on notional alternative sites.*
2. *To examine whether the potential clinical benefits, if any, of locating a Children's hospital beside the Adult hospital on the Mater site outweigh:*
 - I. *Any cost differential; and*
 - II. *Any design issues, including access to the hospital.*

The review was conducted in two phases, corresponding to items 1 and 2 of the terms of reference, and the report is therefore presented in two parts. The first phase – financial analysis and cost comparison – was carried out by a team comprising independent experts in healthcare architecture, capacity planning and clinical content, engineering and infrastructure, quantity surveying and finance. This team was nominated by the European Health Property Network (EuHPN) and led by Mr John Cooper, a UK healthcare architect.

Phase 2 of the review – analysis of clinical, design and access issues – was undertaken by a group of four Chief Executives from some of the world's foremost children's hospitals, drawn from the UK, the USA and Australia. These Chief Executives are paediatricians and experts in child health services, and are members of the National Association of Children's Hospitals and Related Institutions (NACHRI) and the Children's Hospitals International Executive Forum (CHIEF).

It is important to note that the conclusions from phase one of the review underpin, inform, and support the deliberations of the Chief Executive group which carried out phase two.

EuHPN's role in the review process was to facilitate and chair key meetings with a broad range of stakeholders, to quality assure the output of phase one, and to ensure that the review was conducted fairly and independently.

Conclusions

The outcome of phase one, as set out in part 1 of the report, is that the cost of developing the National Paediatric Hospital on the Mater hospital site is similar to those costs which would be incurred if the project was developed on any of the notional alternative sites. If non-recoverable costs and potential revenue savings are considered, there is little financial advantage to selecting any of the comparator sites.

The outcome of phase two, carried out by the NACHRI/CHIEF CEO group, is unanimous and unequivocal support for the immediate implementation of plans to consolidate the current Dublin inpatient acute care paediatric units into a single National Paediatric Hospital on the Mater site.

The CEO group also agrees with the need for the ambulatory and urgent care centre which is proposed for the Tallaght site, and recommends that there should be no further delay in the plans to build a new National Paediatric Hospital at the Mater site.

Jonathan Erskine



Executive Director
European Health Property Network
01.07.2011